

# The Development of Academic Research in Cultural and Creative Industries: A Critical Examination of Current Situations and Future Possibilities

Enkhbold CHULUUNBAATAR, OTTAVIA,  
Ding-Bang LUH, and Shiann-Far KUNG



**Enkhbold CHULUUNBAATAR**,  
Institute of Finance and Economics,  
Mongolia

Enkhbold CHULUUNBAATAR is Assistant Professor in the Department of Business Administration at the Institute of Finance and Economics in Mongolia. His research interests are entrepreneurship, culture and creativity, and creative industries investigation and development. Contact: chboogji@gmail.com



**OTTAVIA**, National Cheng Kung University, Taiwan

OTTAVIA is a postdoctoral research fellow in the Institute of Creative Industries Design at the National Cheng Kung University in Taiwan. Her research interests include organizational behavior, service design, capital investment in creative industries, and creative industries investigation and development. Contact: ottavia@mail.ncku.edu.tw



**Ding-Bang LUH**, National Cheng Kung University, Taiwan

Ding-Bang LUH is Professor in the Department of Industrial Design and the Institute of Creative Industries Design at the National Cheng Kung University in Taiwan. He serves as consultant for Ministry of Economic Affairs and other institutes. Contact: luhdb@mail.ncku.edu.tw



**Shiann-Far KUNG**, National Cheng Kung University, Taiwan

Shiann-Far KUNG is Associate Professor in the Department of Urban Planning at the National Cheng Kung University in Taiwan. He studies spatial planning, science park development, and creative industries investigation. Contact: sfkung@mail.ncku.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

Cultural and creative industries (CCI) is an emerging field of study. Even though this emerging field has been profusely debated and widely discussed, its real research establishment has not been clearly outlined. This research aims to: 1) map the existing studies related to creative industries, cultural industries and creative economy; 2) identify the topics, authors, origins, and methods behind the CCI publications. The results show that CCI studies are imbalanced and scattered, with the lacks of empirical evidence and industry insights. CCI academic research is still in its infant stage with a lot of opportunities and challenges for improvement. This study outlines the current research development in CCI and provides guidance for future studies.

**Keywords:** Cultural industries, Creative industries, Creative economy

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The spirits, legacy and concept of creative industries (also known as cultural industries, creative economy) can be traced back to the critical thoughts of Frankfurt school and British cultural study. The significant phase of conceptual development was started with the work of Bell (1999). The subsequent turning point of creative industries development was the establishment of British Department for Culture Media and Sport (DCMS) in 1997. British Labor Party was among the first to put creative industries as legitimate policy agenda in 1998 (DCMS, 1998, 2001). In subsequent years, the concept of creative industries has spread globally (BOP, 2010; Puchta, Schneider, Haigner, Wakolbinger, & Jenewein, 2010; UN, 2008; UNESCO, 2007) and adopted in many countries worldwide by countries like Australia (CIE, 2009), Hong Kong (CCPR, 2003; HKTDC, 2002), Singapore (Toh, Choo, & Ho, 2003), China (Keane, 2009), Germany (Fesel & Sondermann, 2007), Finland (CIF, 2008), Japan (Yoshimoto, 2009), Latin America (Quartesan, Romis, & Lanzafame, 2007), Africa (Agoralumiére, 2008), Canada (COMPENDIUM, 2008), and USA (Siwek, 2002).

In the global level, creative industries have also gained significant recognitions to create wealth and economic contribution. United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) has emphasized the potential economic contribution of creative industries in developing countries (UNCTAD, 2004). The senior Expert Symposium “Asia-Pacific Creative Communities: Promoting the Cultural Industries for Local Economic Development – a Strategy for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century”, which took place in Jodhpur (India) from 22 to 26 February 2005, established a conceptual model for the promotion of creative sectors as the key economic driver in the Asia-pacific region (UNESCO, 2005). In the following year, Europe conducted the first Europe-wide study of creative economy which was carried out on behalf of the European Commission (KEA, 2006). The consequences of these movements have been materialized into the establishment of creative industries division by World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO, 2005) and the

development of framework for statistics on Cultural Industries within the agenda of the Jodhpur Initiatives (UNESCO, 2007). By 2008, United Nations have compiled definitions, statistics and analysis of the global creative economy (UN, 2008).

Since its first establishment as a national policy in the UK over a decade ago which created a global wave of cultural and creative industries (CCI) in many countries, the field of CCI has drawn a great amount of attention from the academic world. A lot of debates and thought-provoking concepts emerged from these studies; however there are no comprehensive analyses describing the existing CCI studies to give a thorough understanding of what has been done, as well as where, by whom and how. The existing studies have focused more on the concept development and debates on creative industries, but none has directly described the ongoing academic research practices of CCI studies. This study mapped the existing CCI studies and identified the leading authors, institutions, journals, countries in CCI studies and illustrated the ongoing trend of academic research in CCI. Content analysis was conducted to further identify topics and methods used which can be utilized as references for future academic studies in CCI. The article is structured in the following order: the first part explains the terms and concepts of CCI, the second part examines the methodology of the research, the third part presents the results and analyses, and the last part concludes this study. It hopes to bring an overall view on existing CCI academic studies, identify the current trend, and give suggestions for future CCI research.

## 2. CREATIVE INDUSTRIES, CULTURAL INDUSTRIES, AND OTHER TERMS

‘Creative industries’ are economic activities which exploit human knowledge, talent and creativity to produce end products with values which are consumable by mass (DCMS, 1998). Throughout the development of this concept, several other terms have been interchangeably used to refer to these economic activities. This concept was actually born long before it was made into a

legitimate policy agenda by British Labor Party in 1998 (DCMS, 1998). The term 'cultural industries' (originally termed as 'culture industry' was first coined in the early work of Adorno and Horkheimer to describe the intersection of culture and commerce when they made a critical evaluation on industrial development under capitalism (Horkheimer & Adorno, 2002). The term 'creative industries' was used in DCMS report for "those industries which have their origin in individual creativity, skill and talent, and which have a potential for wealth and job creation through the generation and exploitation of intellectual property" (DCMS, 2001, p. 4). The United Nations often refer it as 'creative economy' in their reports (UN, 2008). The same term was officially adopted by UK government in 2006 (BOP, 2010). Scott (2004) suggested the term 'cultural-products industries' to refer to the sectors that produce goods and services with more emphasis on providing sign-value than utilitarian value to the consumer.

'Creative industries', 'culture industry', 'cultural industries', 'creative economy', and 'cultural-products industries' were the most commonly used terms. In this study, we will not scrutinize and justify the appropriate use of terms and definitions that hitherto have remained a contested issue. Instead, we will use the terms which are frequently found in official reports and academic articles related to this field to obtain the highest representative amount of publications needed for this study to cover the issue of 'creative industries' and the like. To avoid confusion and ambiguity, we will use all five terms in the methodology part and refer to 'cultural industries', 'culture industry', 'creative industries', 'creative economy', and 'cultural-products industries' altogether as 'cultural and creative industries' (CCI) throughout this article.

### 3. METHODOLOGY

The data of publications in creative industries was collected from the Web of Science; sample of publications including all academic works which have been published up to March 31, 2013. The Web of Science was selected as the main source

of CCI article samples for its credibility as the database of the world's leading journals in social science, science and technology with SSCI (Social Science Citation Index) and SCI (Science Citation Index). Moreover, the Web of Science also has extensive coverage of over 10,000 journals from 256 categories with back files to the year 1900; it has 7,100 SCI journals and 2,100 SSCI journals ("Web of Science Factsheet," 2008). Since CCI studies involve multidisciplinary expertise (related to social science, science and technology), selecting publications with SSCI and SCI in the Web of Science will act as an early screening for the quality of the publications collected.

Using the search option in the Web of Science, all publications which contain the terms 'cultural industries', 'culture industry', 'creative industries', 'creative economy', and 'cultural-products industries' (both singular and plural terms) in their title and topic were collected; publications from irrelevant fields such as biotechnology, microbiology or medicine, forestry, computer science, and oceanography were excluded; the original articles and citations were downloaded for further analysis. All collected publications were sorted by their relevance to CCI and coded by the types of publications, language, institutions, authors, countries, publishing journal, and field of study. Descriptive analyses were then used to summarize what kinds of study have been done, how, when, where and by whom. Content analysis was used to further analyze the selected samples of articles with the objectives of identifying the current CCI research practices, the existing gaps and future research directions.

## 4. ANALYSES & RESULTS

### 4.1 CCI Authors and their Origins

The keyword search resulted in 2153 CCI publications available in the Web of Science. These publications were dated between 1970s and 2010s. The types of publication varied; there were 1507 articles (70.00%), 379 proceedings paper (17.60%), 224 book reviews (10.40%), 64 reviews (2.97%) and 53 editorial materials (2.46%). Smaller portions were in the form of book chapters (0.23%), news items (0.19%), art exhibit

reviews (0.05%), discussion (0.05%), excerpts (0.05%), item about an individual (0.05%), and reprint (0.05%).

In total, 21 languages were used in CCI publications. The language predominantly being used is English (1933, 89.78%), followed by German (62, 2.88%) and Spanish (48, 2.23%). A total of 75 countries were listed as countries of origin for CCI publications. Region representativeness was analyzed based on total number of countries represented and total number of publications originating from each respective region (Table 1). From total number of 75 countries, North America is the most represented region in CCI study (3 out of 5 countries, 60.00%), followed by Europe (27 out of 53 countries, 50.94%) and Asia (13 out of 35 countries, 37.14%). In term of publication quantity, Europe (1002 publications, 45.65%) and North America (627 publications, 28.56%) were the dominant regions that contribute publications in CCI. Overall, the Western perspective which is represented by Europe, North America, and Australia and Oceania occupied 84.01% of total CCI publications to date.

Most publications were originated from the United States (21.88%), England (15.93%), Australia (8.27%), China (7.71%) and Canada (6.92%). Asia, represented by 13 countries (with

China, Taiwan, Singapore, Japan, and South Korea in the top 25 contributing countries), has a total of 277 publications to date; while Africa, Middle East, South America, Central America and the Caribbean have been under-represented.

The CCI publications came from 1096 institutions (199 records do not specify the institution of origin). The top five highest producers of CCI publication were University of Toronto in Canada (40 publications), Queensland University of Technology in Australia (39 publications), University California Los Angeles in the United States (29 publications), the University of Amsterdam in the Netherlands (23 publications), and the University of Wollongong in Australia (22 publications). Among the top 50 institutions, 46% are located in Europe (23 institutions), 24% are in North America (12 institutions), 22% are in Australia and the Oceania (11 institutions) and 8.00% are in Asia (4 institutions). There were no representatives from Africa, Middle East, South America, Central America and the Caribbean.

There were 2790 names listed as authors of CCI publications; making the average of 0.82 number of articles published per author. Table 2 shows the top 50 authors of CCI publications. The leading authors with the highest quantity of articles are Gibson (22 articles), Scott (20 articles), Leslie (12 articles), Nijkamp (10 articles), and Throsby

**Table 1 Region representativeness in CCI publications**

Rank	Regions <sup>1</sup>	Countries			Publications	
		Total (UN) <sup>2</sup>	With CCI publ. <sup>3</sup>	% rep. <sup>4</sup>	Total	% of 2153
1	North America	5	3	60.00%	627	28.56%
2	Europe	53	27	50.94%	1002	45.65%
3	Asia	35	13	37.14%	277	12.62%
4	South America	14	4	28.57%	38	1.73%
5	Sub-Saharan Africa	50	8	16.00%	27	1.23%
6	Middle East and North Africa	21	3	14.29%	9	0.41%
7	Australia and Oceania	15	2	13.33%	215	9.79%
8	Central America and the Caribbean	32	0	0.00%	0	0.00%

<sup>1</sup>Region grouping was based on United Nations, CIA World Fact Book and cultural proximity

<sup>2</sup>Total number of countries within each region based on the United Nations and CIA World Fact Book data

<sup>3</sup>Total numbers of countries within each region which have CCI publications listed in Web of Science

<sup>4</sup>Percentage of country representativeness: [Countries with CCI publication/Total number of countries] x 100%

(10 articles). Most CCI authors listed below were originated from Northern America, Europe and Australia. Authors from other regions (i.e. Asia, Latin America, Middle East and Africa) were under-represented.

Based on the country of origin, institution and author, it was found that the CCI publications to date were inclined to the Western perspectives; calling for more CCI publications to represent the perspectives of the rest of the world, especially Asia, Middle East, Africa, Oceania, South America and Central America and the Caribbean since those countries have rich cultural heritage and potential creative resources.

#### 4.2 The Development of CCI studies

Over the course of more than 40 years, the number of CCI publications has shown an increasing trend. During the 1970s and 1980s periods, the quantity of publications related to CCI was not significant. Substantial growth occurred in the 1990s and the 2000s. Table 3 shows the trend of CCI publications over the years.

The most significant turning point in CCI publications happened in the late 1990s, the time when CCI development was officially established as a national policy in the UK. There is a significant increase between 1980s and 1990s from 41 to 183, and the trend continues

**Table 2 List of prolific authors of CCI publications**

Rank	Author	Record Count	% of 2153	Rank	Author	Record Count	% of 2153
1	GIBSON C	22	1.02%	26	KLOOSTERMAN RC	5	0.23%
2	SCOTT AJ	20	0.93%	27	LANGE B	5	0.23%
3	LESLIE D	12	0.56%	28	MARKUSEN A	5	0.23%
4	NIJKAMP P	10	0.46%	29	MUSTERD S	5	0.23%
5	THROSBY D	10	0.46%	30	O'CONNOR J	5	0.23%
6	CUNNINGHAM S	9	0.42%	31	OZDEMIR N	5	0.23%
7	FLORIDA R	9	0.42%	32	PINCH S	5	0.23%
8	ZHANG MQ	9	0.42%	33	POTTS J	5	0.23%
9	HANSEN HK	8	0.37%	34	PRINCE R	5	0.23%
10	POWER D	8	0.37%	35	SCHLESINGER P	5	0.23%
11	MELLANDER C	7	0.33%	36	TOWSE R	5	0.23%
12	MIYAKAWA A	7	0.33%	37	AOYAMA Y	4	0.19%
13	PRATT AC	7	0.33%	38	BONTJE M	4	0.19%
14	RANTISI NM	7	0.33%	39	CLIFTON N	4	0.19%
15	SHIBATA Y	7	0.33%	40	COLLIS C	4	0.19%
16	BANKS M	6	0.28%	41	CURRID-HALKETT E	4	0.19%
17	BRENNAN-HORLEY C	6	0.28%	42	FAULCONBRIDGE JR	4	0.19%
18	CHANG TC	6	0.28%	43	FELTON E	4	0.19%
19	COMUNIAN R	6	0.28%	44	FREY BS	4	0.19%
20	REIMER S	6	0.28%	45	HALL S	4	0.19%
21	STOLARICK K	6	0.28%	46	HARTLEY J	4	0.19%
22	CURRID E	5	0.23%	47	HARVEY DC	4	0.19%
23	FLEW T	5	0.23%	48	HAWKINS H	4	0.19%
24	HESMONDHALGH D	5	0.23%	49	HUTTON TA	4	0.19%
25	JONES C	5	0.23%	50	KONG L	4	0.19%

**Table 3 The number of CCI publications by decades**

Decade	Number of Publications	% of total	Growth (+/-)
1970s	14	0.65%	--
1980s	41	1.90%	192.86%
1990s	183	8.50%	346.34%
2000s	1045	48.54%	471.04%
2010s	871	40.46%	-16.65%

to increase in the 2000s with 1045 publications, and 2010s with 871 publications. CCI publication shows a continuous increasing growth.

More than 500 journals featured publications with topics related to CCI. Table 4 illustrates the top 20 journals which contain the highest number of CCI publications.

Within these top 20 journals, most number of publications were found in journals related to urban planning (5 journals), geography (6 journals), media and art (2 journals) and cultural studies (5 journals); the total number of publications amounted to 202 articles (9.38%), 120 articles (5.57%), 63 articles (2.93%), and 50 articles (2.32%) respectively. The rest were journals from economics (3 journals) and industry innovation (1 journal) with 25 articles (1.16%), and 14 articles (0.65%) respectively.

Table 5 shows that the areas of study varied immensely, indicating that the field of CCI has been approached from different disciplines with various perspectives.

Current CCI studies were mostly in the area of business economics (26.99%), geography (19.28%), urban studies (11.57%), environmental sciences ecology (11.38%), and public administration (9.24%). Other subject areas include sociology, communication, cultural studies, computer science, arts, education, engineering, anthropology, law, literature, history. This finding indicated that CCI concepts have been developed with multidisciplinary perspectives.

Based on the use of keywords, publications in CCI were often linked with city(ies) (295 times) and urban areas (171 times), development and

**Table 4 The top 20 journals which contain CCI publications**

Rank	Source Title	Record Count	% of 2153
1	Urban Studies	58	2.69%
2	Environment and Planning	47	2.18%
3	International Journal of Cultural Policy	37	1.72%
4	European Planning Studies	29	1.35%
5	Media Culture Society	28	1.30%
6	Geoforum	27	1.25%
7	International Journal of Urban and Regional Research	27	1.25%
8	Journal of Cultural Economics	25	1.16%
9	Cities	21	0.98%
10	Progress in Human Geography	20	0.93%
11	Regional Studies	20	0.93%
12	Journal of Economic Geography	19	0.88%
13	Journal of Arts Management Law and Society	18	0.84%
14	Media International Australia	17	0.79%
15	Australian Geographer	14	0.65%
16	Industry and Innovation	14	0.65%
17	Urban Geography	14	0.65%
18	Cultural Studies	13	0.60%
19	Economic Geography	13	0.60%
20	Geografiska Annaler Series B Human Geography	13	0.60%

growth (207 times), innovation (153 times), cluster or agglomeration (135 times), place and space (128 times), industry(ies) (127 times), economy (116 times), creativity (107 times), network (100 times), knowledge (97 times), policy(ies) (97 times), and competitiveness (82 times). Various terms have been used to refer to CCI, with the most frequent ones 'creative industries' (187 times), 'cultural industries' (158 times), and 'cultural economy' (103 times). Other terms with less frequent usage include both cultural and creative elements to

**Table 5 Areas of study in CCI publications**

Rank	Subject Area	Record Count	% of 2153
1	Business economics	581	26.69%
2	Geography	415	19.28%
3	Urban studies	249	11.57%
4	Environmental sciences ecology	245	11.38%
5	Public administration	199	9.24%
6	Sociology	190	8.83%
7	Social sciences other topics	122	5.67%
8	Communication	117	5.43%
9	Cultural studies	104	4.83%
10	Computer science	87	4.04%
11	Arts humanities other topics	84	3.90%
12	Education educational research	79	3.67%
13	Engineering	72	3.34%
14	Anthropology	71	3.30%
15	Government law	70	3.25%
16	Literature	67	3.11%
17	History	62	2.88%
18	Operations research management science	61	2.83%
19	Area studies	58	2.69%
20	Information science library	47	2.18%

refer to CCI; 'cultural and creative industries' (16 times), 'cultural creative industries' (13 times), culture creative industries (1 time), and creative and cultural industries (twice). CCI studies were often related to urban areas, indicated by a more frequent occurrence of the keywords 'cities/city' (295 times) and 'urban' (171 times) as opposed to 'rural' (21 times) and 'countryside' (0 times).

Table 6 shows the terms keywords used categorized based on the CCI sectors. Among different sectors in creative industries CCI studies, more attentions have been given to the music and the visual arts and performing arts industry (122 keywords); film and video (114 keywords); and arts (112 keywords). Other promising sectors such as architecture (14), advertising (1), crafts (8),

radio (1), and photography (0) have been under-represented hence creating opportunities for future CCI studies.

### 4.3 The Most Influential and the Most Relevant CCI Publications

The most influential articles were determined by the highest times the article being cited. The most cited CCI publications are listed in Table 7. The average number of citations per article was 3.67.

The most influential articles showed number of times cited far higher than the average. The top 10 most influential articles were published between 1996 and 2006 and the types of papers varied among conceptual paper (1), view point (6), research paper (3) which mainly focused on the concept development (Florida, 2002; Pratt, 1997; Scott, 1997), debates (Markusen, 2006; Peck, 2005; Scott, 2006) and reflection (Hall, 2000) on CCI. The work by Peck (2005) about the concept of creative destruction from economic perspective was the most cited articles (cited by 306 studies), followed by the work of Florida (2002) about his concept on economic geography of talent and creative cities (cited by 187 studies) and an article by Scott (1997) about his perspective on the concentration of cultural economy in cities (cited by 121 studies). Analytical perspectives were mostly from urban studies, economics, geography or the combination of the three (urban economics, economic geography), only two studies were directly taking the cultural economy perspective (Pratt, 1997; Scott, 2004). Among these articles, the concept linking CCI, creative clusters and cities and economic growth were proposed (Florida, 2002) and heavily debated (Markusen, 2006; Peck, 2005; Scott, 2006).

To determine the most relevant articles, we sorted the articles based on the order of relevance using the sort feature provided by the Web of Science. The most relevant publications were published between 2008 and 2010 and more focused on CCI-specific issues. They were mostly research articles which collected empirical evidence related to CCI issues (8 articles) which employed CCI analytical perspective as the construction of CCI concepts have prospered and progressed in the past decade. Those relevant papers indicated the tendency of

**Table 6 Keywords related to sectors in cultural and creative industries**

CCI Sectors*	Total	Examples of keywords
Advertising	13	Advertising (10), advertising agencies (2), advertising industry (1)
Architecture	14	Architectural (1), architectural design problem-solving (1), architectural design process (1), architectural drawings (1), architectural firms (2), architectural identity (1), architectural program (1), architecture (6), architecture and performance (1)
Arts and antique markets	112	Art(s) (44), art and culture (1), art and entertainment industry (1), art and meditation (1), art colleges (1), art designing (1), art district (1), art investment (1), art management (2), art market (1), art market and returns (1), art photography (1), art spaces (1), art world (2), artist(s) (24), artist collectives (1), artist housing (1), artist village (1), artistic goods (1), artistic labor (2), artistic production (1), artistic squats (1), artists' labor markets (1), arts and culture (2), arts entrepreneurship (1), arts festivals (1), arts impact (1), arts index (1), arts indicators (1), arts participation (1), arts planning (1), arts policy (3), art's sake (1), arts-based research (1), auction (1), Blockbuster arts exhibitions (1), street art (1), virtual art (1), visual art(s) (4)
Crafts	8	Craft industry(ies) (2), craft labor (1), craft product (1), craftivism (1), jewelry (2), jewelry industry (1)
Design	36	Creative design (1), creative design education (1), creative design sector (1), design (27), design thinking (1), industrial design (4), interactive design (1)
Designer Fashion	36	Contemporary South African fashion design (1), designer fashion industry (2), fashion (25), fashion and design (1), fashion capitals (1), fashion design (1), fashion design management models (1), fashion industry (3), fashion week (1)
Film, video and photography	114	Amateur cinema (1), Bollywood (1), box-office (1), box-office performance (1), Chinese cinema (1), cinema(s) (5), cinematograph (1), feature films (2), film (20), film distribution (1), film funding (1), film industry (21), film location (1), film narrative (1), film policy (1), film production (2), film theory (1), film work (1), Hollywood (22), Hong Kong film industry (1), motion picture industry (17), movie industry (5), Animation (1), animation industry (1), animation workers (1), anime (1), Audio-visual policy (1), audiovisual (1), audiovisual archivists (1)
Software, computer games and electronic publishing	25	Game industry (1), digital games (1), digital industries (1), digital media (4), online game (2), online game market (1), software industry (2), software piracy (1), video game(s) (5), video game industry (3)
Music and the visual and performing arts	122	Blogs (2), digital content industry (1), digital entertainment (1), Asian pop (1), concert(s) (2), country music (2), digital music (2), hip-hop (4), hip-hop music (1), Korean music industry (1), Korean pop culture wave (1), live music (1), music (31), music business (1), music economy (1), music industry(ies) (20), music policy (1), music programming (1), musicals (1), musicians (2), popular music (20), puppet show (1), rap music (1), recording industry (4), rock music (2), street musicians (1), world music (1), Contemporary dance (1), opera (1), performing arts (6), theater (8), theater group (1), theater scene (1), theatergoers (1)
Publishing	80	Book history (1), book publishing (1), book publishing industry (1), books (1), bookshops (1), comic book production (1), comic bookstore (1), comics (1), content industry(ies) (2), media (37), media industry (30), news industry (1), newspaper (1), world media (1)
Television	43	BBC (2), broadcasting (1), broadcasting policy (1), Korean TV dramas (1), soap opera (2), telenovela (1), telepresence (1), television (21), television commercials (1), television education (1), television flows (2), television format (1), television industry (4), television production industry (1), television programs (1), television studies (1), youth drama (1)
Radio	1	Radio (1)

**Table 7 List of the top cited CCI publications**

Rank	Most cited authors & publications	Total cited
1	Author(s): PECK, J Title: Struggling with the Creative Class Source: International Journal of Urban And Regional Research, 29 (4): 740-770, DEC 2005	306
2	Author(s): FLORIDA, R Title: The Economic Geography of Talent Source: Annals of the Association of American Geographers, 92 (4): 743-755 DEC 2002	187
3	Author(s): SCOTT, AJ Title: The Cultural Economy of Cities Source: International Journal of Urban and Regional Research, 21 (2): 323-339, JUN 1997	164
4	Author(s): SCOTT, AJ Title: Creative Cities: Conceptual Issues and Policy Questions Source: Journal of Urban Affairs, 28 (1): 1-17, 2006	123
5	Author(s): HALL, P Title: Creative Cities and Economic Development Source: Urban Studies, 37 (4): 639-649, APR 2000	116
6	Author(s): MARKUSEN, A Title: Urban Development and the Politics of a Creative Class: Evidence from a Study of Artists Source: Environment and Planning A, 38 (10): 1921-1940 OCT 2006	114
7	Author(s): LEY, D Title: Artists, Aestheticisation and the Field of Gentrification Source: Urban Studies, 40 (12): 2527-2544, NOV 2003	102
8	Author(s): MOMMAAS, H Title: Cultural Clusters and the Post-Industrial City: Towards the Remapping of Urban Cultural Policy Source: Urban Studies, 41 (3): 507-532, MAR 2004	100
9	Author(s): SCOTT, AJ Title: The Craft, Fashion, and Cultural-Products Industries of Los Angeles: Competitive Dynamics and Policy Dilemmas in a Multisectoral Image-Producing Complex Source: Annals of the Association of American Geographers, 86 (2): 306-323 JUN 1996	97
10	Author(s): PRATT, AC Title: The Cultural Industries Production System: A Case Study of Employment Change in Britain, 1984-91 Source: Environment and Planning A, 29 (11): 1953-1974, NOV 1997	46

bringing creative cluster, creative class, creative cities versus countryside and economic growth into current discussions and debates.

In terms of methodology, the influential works focused on theory building, critical debates on CCI concepts and case studies in certain city/region. The most relevant works related to CCI have the tendency to employ qualitative methods using the in-depth-interviews, focus groups, and observation; other few used quantitative methods using primary data (survey) or secondary data. Table 9 shows the method, level of analysis, and data source for the representative of CCI studies.

## 5. DISCUSSIONS

This study intends to map the existing studies dedicated to the field of CCI. The results showed that the number of CCI publications experienced a continuous growth in terms of quantity, especially in the last decade. Multidisciplinary approaches, such as economics, geography, urban studies, cultural studies, planning and development, anthropology, and arts humanities, among others, have been used to develop, study, and describe CCI. Works on CCI have been published in journals of other domains. There are no journals with SSCI and SCI indices which are dedicated specially for CCI. Therefore, in order

**Table 8 The most influential articles and the most relevant articles**

No.	Author	Times cited	Type of article	Analytical perspective
<b><u>Most cited</u></b>				
1	Peck (2005)	306	Conceptual	Economics
2	Florida (2002)	187	Conceptual	Urban economics
3	Scott (1997)	164	Viewpoint	Urban study
4	Scott (2006)	123	Research paper	Urban economics
5	Hall (2000)	116	Research paper	Economic geographic
6	Markusen (2006)	114	Viewpoint	Urban study
7	Ley (2003)	102	Research paper	Urban study
8	Mommaas (2004)	100	Research paper	Geography
9	Scott (1996)	97	Viewpoint	Urban study
10	Pratt (1997)	46	Conceptual	Urban economics, cultural geography
<b><u>Most relevant</u></b>				
11	Collis, Felton, & Graham (2010)	-	Research paper	Cultural and creative industries
12	Harney (2010)	-	Conceptual	Cultural and creative industries
13	Stam (2008)	6	Research paper	Cultural and creative industries
14	Bennet (2010)	-	Research paper	Cultural and creative industries
15	Chapain & Comunian (2010)	-	Research paper	Cultural and creative industries
16	Felton, Collis, & Graham (2010)	-	Research paper	Cultural and creative industries
17	Brennan-Horley (2010)	-	Research paper	Geography
18	Petrov (2008)	-	Research paper	Cultural and creative industries
19	Bell (2010)	-	Research paper	Cultural and creative industries
20	Flew (2010)	-	Viewpoint	Cultural and creative industries

to establish itself as an independent domain, a sovereign platform for researchers to discuss and debate on CCI issues needs to be established.

The focus of the existing studies was built around the claims on the existence of CCI, creative clusters, creative class and creative cities; definitions and measurements of CCI, creative clusters, creative workers and creative cities; the economic benefits of CCI. The publications were dominated with conceptual papers, reviews and debates. More empirical studies are needed to support the concepts and theories of CCI.

Even though the phenomenon is spreading globally, imbalance still exists in the current studies. CCI studies have been dominated by Western perspective. The perspectives from the rest of the world, including Asia, Latin America, Africa and Middle East, had been less explored.

Moreover, the dominant groups of researchers came from business economics, economic geography, urban studies, environmental sciences, public administration, sociology and other social sciences, communication, and cultural studies. It shows that the voices of real practitioners in CCI have been under-represented in current CCI publications. There is the need to incorporate the CCI practitioners' view point into the existing body of CCI knowledge in order to obtain practical insights; for example the views from musician, artists, dancers, painters, architects and photographers. Among the widely-accepted CCI sectors, music industry, advertising and film industry are the sectors which were popularly studied. However, other areas such as architecture, publishing, radio, craft and photography have been barely studied, inviting future investigations in these fields.

**Table 9 Research methodology used in the CCI publications**

Research methodology	Articles*
<b>Methods</b>	
Critical review	1,3,4,5,12,20
Qualitative	2,7,11,13-17,19
Quantitative	7,18,19
Case study	6,8,9,10,19
<b>Level of analysis</b>	
Individual	6,11,14,15,16,17
Firm	13
Industry	7,9
Area/cluster	8
City	2,3,4,7,9,14-17
Region	10,18,19
Abstract/not specified	1,12,20
<b>Data source</b>	
Primary	2,6,7,8,11, 13-19
Secondary	3,7,9,10,19

\* Please refer to Table 8 for the article numbers

Conceptual papers and debates regarding to CCI development dominated the studies from 1970s to 2010s. In the last decade, the current trend is inclined to specific research topics which include creative cluster, class, city and economic growth.

In summary, CCI academic research is still in its infant stage and there are a lot of opportunities and challenges for improvement. This study reveals the following critical gaps in the publications to date: 1) Imbalance in term of origin: the existing publications are Western-oriented with 84.01% alone originated from institutions in Europe (45.65%), North America (28.56%), and Australia and Oceania (9.79%). The CCI perspectives of Asian, Latin American, African and Middle Eastern countries were less explored despite the fact that these countries possess rich cultural heritage and potential creative resources. Languages used in CCI publications were Europe-originated, with English as the most dominant language (89.78%). 2) Imbalance in term of disciplines: CCI has been approached from various disciplines, however the current CCI studies mostly represent the view

of economics, geography, urban studies, cultural studies, and planning and development; neglecting the perspective from art and humanity disciplines which form the core of CCI. 3) Imbalance in term of CCI sectors: CCI publications were mostly studying music industry, arts and antique markets, and film, video, and photography; other potential areas such as architecture, radio, and crafts have been barely studied, inviting future investigations in these sectors. 4) Imbalance in term of analytical framework: CCI publications were mostly theoretical with lack of empirical evidence from academia and practical insights from the industries. There is an urgent need to incorporate the CCI practitioners' viewpoint into the existing body of CCI knowledge to give a holistic view toward CCI issues.

## REFERENCES

- Agoralumiere. (2008). Creative Africa Development Retrieved March, 30, 2011, from [http://www.creative-africa.org/CREATIVE-AFRICA\\_2008/index.php?option=com\\_wrapper&Itemid=116](http://www.creative-africa.org/CREATIVE-AFRICA_2008/index.php?option=com_wrapper&Itemid=116)
- Bell, Daniel. (1999). *The Coming of Post-Industrial Society: A Venture in Social Forecasting*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- BOP. (2010). Mapping the Creative Industries: A Toolkit (pp. 60). London: British Council Creative Economy Unit.
- CCPR. (2003). Baseline Study on Hong Kong's Creative Industries In D. Hui (Ed.), (pp. 227). Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong.
- CIE. (2009). Creative Industries Economic Analysis (pp. 80). Canberra & Sydney: Creative Industries Innovation Centre
- CIF. (2008). Creative Industries Finland Retrieved March, 30, 2011, from <http://www.creativeindustries.fi/index.php/creativeindustriesfinland>
- COMPENDIUM. (2008). Canada: Specific Policy Issues and Recent Debates Retrieved March, 30, 2011, from <http://www.culturalpolicies.net/web/canada.php?aid=423>
- DCMS. (1998). Creative Industries Mapping Document Retrieved March 30, 2011, from [http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/+/http://www.culture.gov.uk/reference\\_library/publications/4740.aspx](http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/+/http://www.culture.gov.uk/reference_library/publications/4740.aspx)
- DCMS. (2001). Creative Industries Mapping Document Retrieved March 30, 2011, from [http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/+/http://www.culture.gov.uk/reference\\_library/publications/4740.aspx](http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/+/http://www.culture.gov.uk/reference_library/publications/4740.aspx)

- gov.uk/reference\_library/publications/4632.aspx
- Fesel, Bernd, & Sondermann, Michael. (2007). Culture and Creative Industries in Germany (pp. 40). Bonn: German Commission for UNESCO.
- Florida, R. (2002). The Economic Geography of Talent. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 92(4), 743-755.
- Hall, P. (2000). Creative cities and economic development. *Urban Studies*, 37(4), 639-649. doi: 10.1080/00420980050003946
- HKTDC. (2002). Creative Industries in Hong Kong Retrieved March, 30, 2011, from <http://info.hktdc.com/econforum/tdc/tdc020902.htm>
- Horkheimer, Max, & Adorno, Theodor W. (2002). *The Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments* (E. Jephcott, Trans.). Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- KEA. (2006). The Economy of Culture in Europe: KEA European Affairs.
- Keane, Michael. (2009). Creative Industries in China: Four Perspectives on Social Transformation. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 15(4), 431 - 443.
- Markusen, A. (2006). Urban development and the politics of a creative class: evidence from a study of artists. *Environment and Planning A*, 38(10), 1921-1940. doi: 10.1068/a38179
- Peck, J. (2005). Struggling with the creative class. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 29(4), 740-+. doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2427.2005.00620.x
- Pratt, A. C. (1997). The cultural industries production system: a case study of employment change in Britain, 1984-91. *Environment and Planning A*, 29(11), 1953-1974. doi: 10.1068/a291953
- Puchta, Dieter, Schneider, Friedrich, Haigner, Stefan, Wakolbinger, Florian, & Jenewein, Stefan. (2010). An International Overview on the Creative Industries *The Berlin Creative Industries* (pp. 41-52): Gabler.
- Quartesan, Alessandra, Romis, Monica, & Lanzafame, Francesco. (2007). Cultural Industries in Latin America and the Caribbean: Challenges and Opportunities (pp. 50): The Institutional Capacity and Finance Department of the Inter-American Development Bank
- Scott, A. J. (1997). The cultural economy of cities. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 21(2), 323-&. doi: 10.1111/1468-2427.00075
- Scott, A. J. (2004). Cultural-products industries and urban economic development - Prospects for growth and market contestation in global context. *Urban Affairs Review*, 39(4), 461-490. doi: 10.1177/1078087403261256
- Scott, A. J. (2006). Creative cities: Conceptual issues and policy questions. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 28(1), 1-17. doi: 10.1111/j.0735-2166.2006.00256.x
- Siwek, Stephen E. (2002). Copyright Industries in the U.S. Economy (pp. 28). Washington, DC: Economists Incorporated and the International Intellectual Property Alliance.
- Toh, Mun Heng, Choo, Adrian, & Ho, Terence. (2003). Economic Contributions of Singapore's Creative Industries (pp. 75). Singapore: Economist Economics Division Ministry of Trade and Industry.
- UN. (2008). Creative Economy Report 2008: The Challenge of Assessing the Creative Economy: towards Informed Policy-making (pp. 333). Geneva: United Nations.
- UNCTAD. (2004). Creative Industries and Development (pp. 14): UNCTAD
- UNESCO. (2005). Asia-Pacific Creative Communities: A Strategy for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: The Jodhpur Initiatives. Bangkok: UNESCO Bangkok.
- UNESCO. (2007). Statistics on Cultural Industries: Framework for the Elaboration of National Data Capacity Building Projects (pp. 111). Bangkok: UNESCO Bangkok.
- Web of Science Factsheet. (2008). [http://thomsonreuters.com/content/science/pdf/Web\\_of\\_Science\\_factsheet.pdf](http://thomsonreuters.com/content/science/pdf/Web_of_Science_factsheet.pdf)
- WIPO. (2005). IP for development: Creative Industries. Retrieved March, 30, 2011, from [http://www.wipo.int/ip-development/en/creative\\_industry/](http://www.wipo.int/ip-development/en/creative_industry/)
- Yoshimoto, Mitsuhiro. (2009). Creative Industry Trends: The Creative-industry Profiles of Japan's Ordinance-designed Cities (pp. 8): Art and Cultural Projects Social Development Research Group.